

DEPARTMENT OF PLANNING

Dr. Robert L. Yeager Health Center
50 Sanatorium Road, Building T
Pomona, New York 10970
Phone: (845) 364-3434 Fax: (845) 364-3435

Douglas J. Schuetz
Acting Commissioner

Arlene R. Miller
Deputy Commissioner

August 8, 2018

Spring Valley Planning Board
200 N. Main Street
Spring Valley, NY 10977

Tax Data: 49.76-1-52

Re: GENERAL MUNICIPAL LAW REVIEW: Section 239 L and M

Map Date: 1/5/2017

Date Review Received: 6/28/2018

Item: 29 YALE DRIVE - CONGREGATION BOYAN MONSEY (SV-672C)

A site plan application to construct a place of worship on 0.22 acres in the R-1A zoning district. Variances are required for lot area, lot width, side yard, rear yard, total side yards, floor area ratio, number of parking spaces, and parking in the front yard. This is a re-approval of the site plan as the initial review was not submitted to the Rockland County Department of Planning as required under New York State General Municipal Law, Section 239L.

The southern side of Yale Drive, approximately 100 feet west of Dana Road.

Reason for Referral:

Town of Ramapo

The County of Rockland Department of Planning has reviewed the above item. Acting under the terms of the above GML powers and those vested by the County of Rockland Charter, I, the Commissioner of Planning, hereby:

****Disapprove***

1 A place of worship is permitted by right within the R-1A zoning district. However, this use is subject to stricter bulk requirements than what is required for one or two-family dwellings. This site is particularly deficient in meeting these more stringent standards. With only 9,600 square feet, the subject site is only slightly larger than the minimum standard of 8,500 square feet for a one or two-family residence, and provides only 38% of the required lot area for a place of worship. As a result of the inadequate size of the lot, additional, substantial bulk variances are required. In addition, the small lot size results in a significant lack of required parking spaces. This suggests a general overdevelopment of an undersized site. This property must be developed in a manner that is more appropriate to its size.

29 YALE DRIVE - CONGREGATION BOYAN MONSEY (SV-672C)

2 Permitting development that does not comply with the applicable bulk standards can set an undesirable land use precedent and result in the overutilization of individual sites. The proposed lot area is deficient by 62%. The lot width is 80% of the required minimum. The side and total side yards are deficient by 40% and the rear yard is deficient by 55%. With a requirement of 33 parking spaces, the six spaces provided will only accommodate 18% of the parking requirement. The floor area ratio exceeds the maximum requirement by 163%. The ability of the existing infrastructure to accommodate increased residential density on undersized parcels is a countywide concern and must be evaluated. This evaluation must consider whether local roads will become more congested and the sewer system, stormwater management systems and the public water supply will be overburdened. The Village must consider the cumulative and regional impacts of permitting such development.

The following comments address our additional concerns about this proposal.

3 The Town of Ramapo is the reason this proposal was referred to this department for review. The municipal boundary is adjacent to the southern property line of the parcel. New York State General Municipal Law states that the purposes of Sections 239-l, 239-m and 239-n shall be to bring pertinent inter-community and countywide planning, zoning, site plan and subdivision considerations to the attention of neighboring municipalities and agencies having jurisdiction. Such review may include inter-community and county-wide considerations in respect to the compatibility of various land uses with one another; traffic generating characteristics of various land uses in relation to the effect of such traffic on other land uses and to the adequacy of existing and proposed thoroughfare facilities; and the protection of community character as regards predominant land uses, population density, and the relation between residential and nonresidential areas. In addition, Section 239-nn was enacted to encourage the coordination of land use development and regulation among adjacent municipalities, and as a result development occurs in a manner that is supportive of the goals and objectives of the general area.

The Town of Ramapo must be given the opportunity to review the proposal and its impact on community character, traffic, water quantity and quality, drainage, stormwater runoff and sanitary sewer service. The areas of countywide concern noted above that directly impact the Town of Ramapo must be considered and satisfactorily addressed, as well as any additional concerns about the proposal.

4 The applicant must comply with all comments made by the Rockland County Department of Health in their letter of July 12, 2018.

5 The applicant must comply with all comments made by the Rockland County Sewer District No. 1 in their letter of July 27, 2018.

6 Prior to the start of construction or grading, all soil and erosion control measures must be in place for the site. These measures must meet the latest edition (November 2016) of the New York State Guidelines for Urban Erosion and Sediment Control.

7 There shall be no net increase in the peak rate of discharge from the site at all design points.

8 Water is a scarce resource in Rockland County; thus proper planning and phasing of this project are critical to supplying the current and future residents of the Villages, Towns, and County with an adequate supply of water. A letter from the public water supplier, stamped and signed by a NYS licensed professional engineer, shall be issued to the municipality, certifying that there will be a sufficient water supply during peak demand periods and in a drought situation.

29 YALE DRIVE - CONGREGATION BOYAN MONSEY (SV-672C)

- 9 If any public water supply improvements are required, engineering plans and specifications for these improvements shall be reviewed by the Rockland County Department of Health prior to construction. In order to complete an application for approval of plans for public water supply improvements, the water supplier must supply an engineer's report pursuant to the "Recommended Standards for Water Works, 2003 Edition," that certifies their ability to serve the proposed project while meeting the criteria contained within the Recommended Standards for Water Works. These standards are adopted in their entirety in 10 NYCRR, Subpart 5-1, the New York State regulations governing public water systems. Further, both the application and supporting engineer's report must be signed and stamped by a NYS licensed professional engineer and shall be accompanied by a completed NYS Department of Health Form 348, which must be signed by the public water supplier.
- 10 Public sewer mains requiring extensions within a right-of-way or an easement shall be reviewed and approved by the Rockland County Department of Health prior to construction.
- 11 A lighting plan shall be provided that shows fields of illumination. This plan must demonstrate that the intensity of the candle lumens is less than 0.1 at the property line.
- 12 All proposed signage shall be indicated on the site plan and shall conform to the municipality's sign standards.
- 13 The bulk table indicates that several required variances have been granted previously for this project. Such a variance application would be required by General Municipal Law to be forwarded to the Rockland County Planning Department for review. This department has no record of receiving a variance application for this project. Any variances required for this project must be forwarded to the County Planning Department for review and processed in compliance with the requirements of General Municipal Law prior to the issuance of a building permit or Certificate of Occupancy.
- 14 The application form indicates the property receives water service from United Water and is located in the R-1 zoning district. The form must be corrected to Suez and the R-1A zoning district. In addition, the bulk table indicates the property is in the R-1 zoning district and must also be corrected. The public hearing notice must be reviewed and, if it contains inaccurate information, reissued.
- 15 The site plan map notes shall include district information.
- 16 It will be difficult to maneuver out of parking spaces 1 and 6 without a turnaround area. In order to prevent vehicles from backing into the roadway, a turnaround area must be provided.
- 17 Since only 18% of the required parking spaces are provided, areas designated for snow removal must be clearly delineated on the site plan so that the plow drivers will know where to place snow piles. This will help to protect the proposed landscaping from damage due to the weight of the snow and salt intrusion. In addition, providing specific locations on the site for the snow piles will reduce the loss of available parking spaces meant to be used by congregants.
- 18 The NYS Department of State has determined that the Village is not administering or enforcing the State Uniform Fire Prevention and Building Code in accordance with minimum standards set forth in 19 NYCRR part 1203. Given the concerns about the Village's administration and enforcement of the State Uniform Fire Prevention and Building Code initially raised in the Executive Deputy Secretary of State's letter of July 15, 2016, and subsequently again in December 18, 2017, the proposed residential building must be held to the requisite minimum standards and comply with all requirements of this code.
- 19 Pursuant to General Municipal Law (GML) Section 239-m and 239-n, if any of the conditions of this GML review are overridden by the board, then the local land use board must file a report with the County Commissioner of Planning of the final action taken. If the final action is contrary to the recommendation of the Commissioner, the local land use board must state the reasons for such action.

29 YALE DRIVE - CONGREGATION BOYAN MONSEY (SV-672C)

20 In addition, pursuant to Executive Order 01-2017 signed by County Executive Day on May 22, 2017, County departments are prohibited from issuing a County permit, license, or approval until the report is filed with the County Commissioner of Planning. The applicant must provide to any County agency which has jurisdiction of the project: 1) a copy of the Commissioner report approving the proposed action; or 2) a copy of the Commissioner of Planning recommendations to modify or disapprove the proposed action, and a certified copy of the land use board statement overriding the recommendations to modify or disapprove, and the stated reasons for the land use board's override.



Douglas J. Schuetz/
Acting Commissioner of Planning

cc: Mayor Alan Simon, Spring Valley
Rockland County Department of Health
Rockland County Sewer District #1
New York State Department of State

Anthony R. Celentano P.L.S.
Town of Ramapo
Construction Expediting

Rockland County Planning Board Members

**NYS General Municipal Law Section 239 requires a vote of a 'majority plus one' of your agency to act contrary to the above findings.*

The review undertaken by the Rockland County Planning Department is pursuant to, and follows the mandates of Article 12-B of the New York General Municipal Law. Under Article 12-B the County of Rockland does not render opinions, nor does it make determinations, whether the item reviewed implicates the Religious Land Use and Institutionalized Persons Act. The Rockland County Planning Department defers to the municipality forwarding the item reviewed to render such opinions and make such determinations if appropriate under the circumstances.

In this respect, municipalities are advised that under the Religious Land Use and Institutionalized Persons Act, the preemptive force of any provision of the Act may be avoided (1) by changing a policy or practice that may result in a substantial burden on religious exercise, (2) by retaining a policy or practice and exempting the substantially burdened religious exercise, (3) by providing exemptions from a policy or practice for applications that substantially burden religious exercise, or (4) by any other means that eliminates the substantial burden.

Proponents of projects are advised to apply for variances, special permits or exceptions, hardship approval or other relief.

Pursuant to New York State General Municipal Law §239-m(6), the referring body shall file a report of final action it has taken with the Rockland County Department of Planning within thirty (30) days after final action. A referring body which acts contrary to a recommendation of modification or disapproval of a proposed action shall set forth the reasons for the contrary action in such report.